



## Remuneration and Service Delivery in the Civil Services of Benue and Kwara States, Nigeria

TAIYE ADEWALE AWOTUNDE, OLAWOLE OJO  
Babcock University, Ilishan-Remo, Ogun State, Nigeria.

**Abstract.** The importance of remuneration in the sphere of public administration cannot be overemphasised. It is as a result of this that civil servants often clamour for better pay and improved welfare. The first major attempt at enhancing workers' wages in Nigeria was made when the Udoji Commission reviewed the salaries of civil servants in 1974. The general objective of this study was to examine how remuneration affects service delivery in the civil service, with Benue and Kwara States as case study. The study examined the benefits and the challenges of remuneration in the civil service. The study also examined the issue of wage disparity among the federal and state government in Benue and Kwara States. The study anchored on Max-Weber's bureaucratic theory. The methodology adopted for the study was survey research design. The population of the study was 1439, while the sample size was 313 based on Taro Yemani's formula. The study adopted structured questionnaire for the collection of primary data. The study revealed that remuneration had significant effect on service delivery in Benue and Kwara States,  $F(1,304) = 53.077$  ( $P < 0.05$ ). Based on its findings, the study recommends that Benue and Kwara States should increase their revenue drives, in order to be able to augment with what they receive from the federation account.

**Keywords:** Bureaucracy, civil service, motivation, remuneration, service delivery.

### 1. Introduction

All over the world, remuneration is perceived as an important aspect of human survival. It is a means by which workers are able to meet up with their needs, especially the basic ones. These needs have been classified by Abraham Maslow into an hierarchy of needs. It starts with the physiological needs, which are basic needs of food, clothing and shelter. Others

in the hierarchy are safety or security needs, social needs or love and belonging needs, esteem or prestige needs and the need for self-actualisation (Aruma and Hannachor, 2017).

The concept of remuneration gained much recognition with industrial revolution of the late 1700s and early 1800s, that began in Britain. Societies developed from agrarian to industrial ones, and with the growth of factories, people began working for companies that were sited in urban areas (Chen, 2007). In developing countries like Nigeria, the wage system became paramount as the society developed from the era of feudalism to capitalism.

The need to elevate the standard of living of the workers and also improve productivity, especially of civil servants, led to introduction of minimum wage in Nigeria. The clamour for a minimum wage was at the instance of Hassan Sumonu led Nigerian Labour Congress in 1979. This was as a result of a pay rise for political leaders when Nigeria was ushered into a democratic dispensation in 1979. This led to a major strike, with the Shagari led government agreeing to a minimum wage package of ₦125.00 per month (Fagbemi, 2018). At the state level, the issue of increase in remuneration has always been a source of rancor and acrimony between labour and the government based on reluctance to increase workers' remuneration.

The general objective of this study is to examine the effect of remuneration on service delivery in the civil services in Benue and Kwara States of Nigeria. The specific objectives are to: examine the benefits and challenges of a good remuneration package in the civil service; explore the issue of wage disparity between the federal government on one hand, and Benue and Kwara states on the other; examine the effect of remuneration on service delivery in Benue and Kwara states. Previous studies centred on work

environment and service delivery without dwelling on remuneration in particular and how it influenced the delivery of services by the civil servants.

### 1.1 Statement of the Problem

It is noticeable that service delivery in Nigerian civil service is poor. However, scholars and researchers in the past had attributed this problem of poor service delivery to many factors. Meanwhile, out of the reasons given for poor service delivery in Nigeria, remuneration has never received a fair share. Remuneration is an important aspect of service delivery in the civil service. Good remuneration is a means of motivating workers for better performance in the provision of essential services in the state. Therefore there is a need to look into the problem of poor remuneration in Benue and Kwara states so as to motivate workers for effective and efficient service delivery.

## 2. Literature Review

The concepts that are being reviewed in this study are remuneration, service delivery and civil service.

**Remuneration:** Remuneration, otherwise known as employee compensation, has been variously defined by scholars in both private and public sectors. Remuneration is the benefit or payment that an employee enjoys from his employer, for service that he or she has rendered based on the terms of contract of the employment that exist between them (Oluata, 2019). In addition, Oluata (2019) posited that remuneration or compensation can come in different forms. These are in form of salary, housing allowance, transport allowance and launch allowance.

In a similar but slightly different manner, Odunlade (2012) sees employee compensation as all forms of financial returns and benefits that are tangible in nature that an employee is given while in employment. Remuneration can be in two parts; these are hourly or weekly wages. Fringe benefits can be divided into two, namely, legally required benefit programmes and discretionary benefits. Examples of legally required benefits programmes are pension plans, paid time-off, recognition owned, tuition reimbursement, promotion and annual increment. As could be seen, legally required benefits are all futuristic in nature.

In addition to defining remuneration, James (2021), gave various determinants of what employees will see as remuneration. James (2021) opined that remuneration is what an employee receives as

payment for services rendered. This includes basic salary, bonuses and other economic benefits that an employee or executive receives in the course of employment. What is central to all the definitions is that remuneration has to do with entitlement that exists in form of salaries, bonuses, and allowances of employees, paid by their employer(s).

**Service Delivery:** Service delivery is the provision of basic services, namely, roads, electricity, health services, and safe water supply; and they are often the responsibilities of municipality (DBSA, 2022). The municipality in South Africa; for instance, are expected to maintain healthy living for their inhabitants through efficient and effective service delivery. In addition, it has been realised that poor service delivery often results in poor government services, reduction in available resources, job losses and poor living conditions (DBSA, 2022).

It is the federal, state and local government, that is, the three tiers of government that are engaged in delivery of service. In other words, public service is a basic responsibility of the state. The 1999 Constitution of Nigeria has vested the government with certain powers like controlling the national economy, with a view to securing maximum welfare for the people and also ensuring freedom and happiness of every citizen on the basis of social justice and equality of state and opportunity (Section 16 (1) (6)). In addition, Darma and Alli (2014) and Ibuzor (2017) posited that Section 16 (2) [6] of the 1999 constitution states that appropriate and sufficient shelter, abundant food, reasonable national minimum living wage, old age care, pension, unemployment and welfare of the disabled are to be ensured for all citizens.

Moreover, Oronsanye (2010) cited in Nwekeaku and Obiorah, (2019), sees public service as a means of satisfying the needs of the citizens through timely and well-organised procedures, often involving the various ministries of the state. These needs are necessities of life like roads, water, shelter and health services. They were being viewed in terms of their efficient delivery in the state.

In spite of importance of the civil service in rendering services to the people for socio-economic development, the roles of other institutions or stakeholders in rendering services cannot be overemphasised. Public enterprises also play important roles in provision of services to the people, such as electricity and water. However, these public enterprises have been criticised for their dismal performance in rendering services. As Anyebe (2018) observed, the public enterprises have failed to meet

up with public aspirations in terms of quality and quantity of services, generation of returns on investment and inability to provide reliable services.

**Civil Service:** The civil service is the body responsible for the implementation of government policies and programmes. It performs mainly administrative and executive function that has to do with the formulation and implementation of the policies and programmes of the government (Edeh, 2020). From time to time, the Nigerian government comes up with policies in the sphere of health, education, water and roads that the civil service is expected to implement. This is to ensure improvement in the people's living conditions and also promote socio-political and economic development in the country. As aptly put by Igbokwe-Ibeto, Agbodike and Osawe (2015), the civil service is the major means of managing development at different levels.

The civil service can also be seen as a body made up of civil servants and their activities that involve implementing assigned functions and decisions of political office holders (Smalyskys and Yubalovic, 2017). "In other words, it is a system of civil servants who perform the assigned functions of public administration". As further asserted by Smalyskys and Yubalovic (2017), the definition and scope of civil service varies from one country to another. While some states like Island and Poland have a narrow perception of national civil service, countries like France, Finland and Netherlands have a broader view of it. In a country like Italy thus, its view of the civil service covers not only the central and local governments, but also public sector employees who perform public sector functions such as educational institutions and government agencies. In Nigeria, the civil service covers only government Ministries at both the federal and state levels and local government council officials.

### 3. Theoretical Framework

This study anchored on Bureaucratic theory as observed by Nwogwugwu (2015), Max-Weber (1864-1920) is the major proponent of bureaucratic theory. The theory was proposed in 1922 (Prachi, 2021). Max-Weber in his analysis came up with an ideal type of bureaucracy that could serve as a platform or template for the comparison of the development of real bureaucracies (Serpa and Ferraira, 2019). This means while setting up organisation, whether public or private, the ideal type of bureaucracy can serve as yardstick for the proposed one.

The major assumptions of Max-Weber bureaucratic theory are that, a rational legal system of authority is (i) universally applicable, that is, can be put into operation in any country; and (ii) the most efficient mode of organisation, that is, no other system of authority is efficient as the legal-rational system (Poisson, 2020).

Max-Weber, while postulating his theory, came up with ideal characteristics of bureaucracy, which has been widely accepted as basis for the setting up of both private and public organisations like government Ministries, Departments and Agencies. Based on the analysis of Max-Weber's definition of bureaucracy, Julien, Freud (1996) cited in Serpan and Ferreira (2019), present the following principles as basis of Max-Weber's work: (i) the existence of written rules and regulations or terms that aid the division of functions in a clear manner; (ii) secured tenure of office for public servants; (iii) hierarchy of responsibilities/functions; (iv) employees are paid wages in the form of fixed salaries and pensions for retirees of the organisation; (v) recruitments are based on merits and qualifications; (vi) promotion is based on lay down rules and qualification, not on the basis of discretion; (viii) separation of official positions for individuals that perform the functions of these positions (Serpa and Ferraira, 2019).

Weber's bureaucratic theory has been criticised from various perspectives. Critics, namely Sharma, Sadana and Kaur (2013) had attacked the theory from ideological angle in the sense that the theory is regarded as defence of capitalist domination over the society.

Moris (2017) had also criticised Weber's bureaucracy on the ground that Weber's advocacy damages organisation's effectiveness thereby making it unsuitable for modern organisation. Its inefficiency emanates from too much emphasis on rules and rigidity, coupled with its impersonal approach.

In spite of criticism against Weber's theory, it provides the necessary guidance needed for administration decisions in organisations (Prichi, 2019). In addition, it ensures that the right person is placed in the right position in an office. Weber's bureaucratic theory is relevant to this study in the sense that the principles and characteristics embedded in the theory like remuneration, have been incorporated into the civil services or even at a broader level, the public services of different states.

#### 4. Benefits and Challenges of Remuneration in the Civil Services

##### 4.1 Benefits

Remuneration as could be seen has its own benefits. Cole (2002) in his analysis on salary, benefits and incentives, came up with three principal purposes of payment in an organisation. These are in order to attract sufficient and sustainable employees; for the retention of employees for their efforts; loyalty and achievement. It is imperative to note that some employees can also enjoy better pay in order to enhance their welfare and make them happy.

In a much broader sense, the benefits of remuneration as indicated by U.K. Essays (2013) and adapted by Benson and Lasisi (2019) are as follows: (i) mutual benefits: this implies that the benefits of remuneration or reward system are not mutually exclusive as they are not confined to the employees alone. The employers also benefit in terms of increase in productivity; (ii) motivation: remuneration or reward system also promote loyalty or draw employees to an organisation; (iii) team work: this is when employees see themselves as working towards the same goal, and this is enhanced through reward system or good remuneration.

Martin and Whiting (2016) posited that if an organisation adopt a managed approach to reward, it would help in the development of performance culture and it would also help in attracting and retaining the right people with the right skills; employees would also be motivated and engaged. This in essence implies good service delivery. While expanding on this, Abah and Nwoku (2016) in their study examined the strategies that can be used to motivate workers to work and secure higher productivity. These are enhanced compensations, which are financial rewards that will include basic pay, allowances and incentives.

##### 4.2 Challenges

Multiplicity of government Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs): It has been realised that the wage bills for civil servants in developing countries like Nigeria during the 1970s and 1980s ballooned with the expansion of development in this country. There was increase in the number of Ministries, Departments and Agencies and state-owned enterprises. As the need to deliver education and health to the people increased, government expenditure grew (World Bank Group n.d). Currently, as established by the Oronsanye Report,

Nigeria has 541 federal government parastatals, commissions and agencies, some are statutory while other are none-statutory (Olaopa, 2021). As a result of the increase in cost of governance, the Oronsanye Report recommended a merger in the number of the agencies to reduce cost. This is a challenge to good remuneration in the mist of economic recession, as the government would find it difficult to increase salary when workers demand for it.

Attitude to wage increase by the wages commission: With an over-bloated civil service, and increasing salary/wages, the situation has often resulted to a small amount left in the coffers of government that has the responsibility for determining the pay of civil servants through an independent body. In Nigeria, it is the National Salaries and Wages Commission that is responsible for determining the pay and fixing of other benefits of civil servants often, it involves extensive collective bargaining by employee unions (World Bank n.d). Though, during military era, this was not the case, as collective bargaining took a new dimension, with the setting up of the wage commission and wage tribunals in order to fix salaries and also settle industrial disputes, there was also increasing unilateral role of government in determination of salaries (Amobi, 2015). Some state governments these days are also involve in unilateral declaration of remuneration for their workers as against the practice of collective bargaining.

Moreover, a critical analysis of the review of salaries and wages by the Wages Tribunal and Commission has indicated that they have never provided a proper and desired rational review of public service salaries and wages. It has also been realised that sometimes wage commissions had complicated issues and their awards have served as source of industrial disharmony (Amobi, 2015). For instance, Anambra State, like some other states in Nigeria has experienced increase in wages for civil servants, which has never met up with the needs and expectation of the people (Okeke, Nwele and Achilike, 2017).

Government's insensitivity to demand for good pay: when the government either at the federal or state level is insensitive towards workers' demand for a pay rise, there is challenge to the adoption of a good remuneration package for them. This insensitivity often results in industrial disharmony in Nigeria between the government and labour, which can lead to strike action. This as observed by Babatola, Oluwasanmi and Rotkang (2020) was experienced in Ekiti State, with federal government's 2011 minimum wage that resulted in prolonged industrial

dispute between workers and the state government. This eventually made the work environment to be uncondusive, with negative implication for productivity and service delivery in the state service.

Ability to pay: Sule, Amoni, Obasa and Banjo (2015), had asserted that the ability to pay serves as a challenge to a good remuneration package by the government. This is often noticeable when a country is witnessing economic recession.

**5. Civil Service Remuneration at the Federal Level, Benue and Kwara States**

It is worth noting that there often exists disparity between the pay of federal civil servants and that of their states counterparts and even among the states. Civil servants, in most cases, working with federal civil service are better remunerated than most states

civil servants. For instance, the new minimum wage of ₦30,000 being implemented by the federal government took effect from Thursday, April 18, 2019 (Ezigbo, Olaitan, Kolawole and Shittu, 2019). Even though, the law applies to both the public and private organisations that employ not less than 25 workers, many states still find it difficult to implement as a result of dwindling economic resources brought about by COVID-19 pandemic and security challenges and other pressing issues. Benue State said it was set to implement the new minimum wage for its civil servants from grade level 01 to 06 by December, 2020. Other workers on grade level 07 and above would have to wait till payroll issues are sorted out (Charles, 2020; Wantu, 2020).

The table below (Table 1.0) shows the disparities between the Federal, Benue and Kwara States salaries for the respective civil servants

**Table 1.0:** Showing Wage Disparity among the following

GL	Kwara State Salary Structure Effective from 2011 (Step I)	Benue State Salary Structure Effective from 2011 (Step I)	Federal Government Salary Structure Effective from 2019 (Step I)	
			Per Annum	Monthly
01	19,402	18,000	360,000	30,000
02	19,701	18,277	363,328	30,277.3
03	19,965.56	18,514	366,170	30,514.6
04	20,696.66	19,350	376,194	31,349.5
05	21,382.54	20,875	294,498	32,874.8
06	22,436.03	25,452	449,429	37,452.4
07	27,662.75	43,413	638,133	53,177.7
08	30,676.61	58,000	799,421	68,618.4
09	35,435.80	68,916	928,981	77,415
10	40,820.49	81,910	1,060,833	88,402.7
12	48,955.89	95,375	1,221,722	101,810.1
13	53,947.53	107,125	1,362,110	113,509.1
14	59,084.72	110,774	1,503,149	125,262.4
15	89,161.54	157,645	2,027,623	168,968.5
16	121,162.96	198,330	2,505,352	208,779.3
17	151749.12	239,105	4,769,304	399,442

**Source:** National Salaries Incomes and Wages Commission 2019, The Presidency, Abuja. The Benue State Government of Nigeria, Approved Salary Structure (CONPSS) 2011 Kwara State Consolidated Salary Structure, 2011

From the table above, it would be seen that there exists wide disparity between the salaries of Kwara and Benue State workers which is noticeable among workers on grade level 07 and above. With regards to the Federal pay, as seen in the table above, Federal Civil Servants in Nigeria are better remunerated than their counterparts at the state level.

**6. Data Presentation and Analysis**

**Table 1.1:** Descriptive Statistics of Remuneration of Civil Servants in Benue and Kwara States

S/N	STATEMENT	SA(5)	A(4)	D(3)	SD(2)	UD(1)	M	SD
		F(%)	F(%)	F(%)	F(%)	F(%)		
1	What I earn as salary is good and I feel satisfied to work efficiently.	37 (12.1)	77 (25.2)	84 (27.5)	67 (22.0)	40 (13.1)	2.78	1.360
2	My salary commensurate with my work performance, thus given me satisfaction on the job.	35 (11.5)	67 (22)	104 (34.1)	62 (20.3)	37 (12.1)	2.70	1.323
3	My workplace provides incentives that make me perform better on the job than my colleagues elsewhere.	33 (10.8)	78 (25.6)	95 (31.1)	51 (16.7)	48 (15.7)	2.80	1.282

4	My enhanced pay has prevented me from leaving the establishment and also ensures improvement in my work performance	28 (9.2)	73 (23.9)	98 (32.1)	45 (14.8)	61 (20)	2.81	1.219
5	My salary and allowances have made me comfortable, safe and healthy and thus motivate me to work well.	34 (11.1)	69 (22.6)	93 (30.5)	59 (19.3)	50 (16.4)	2.76	1.303
<b>Remuneration (Mean =2.77)</b>								

Source: Field Survey, 2022

Decision Rule: 0.5-1.49 = Undecided; 1.5-2.49 = strongly disagree; 2.5-3.49 = disagree; 3.5-4.49 = Agree; 4.5-5.0 = Strongly Agree. The cut-Off mean is 3.0

Table 1.1 reveals the opinions of the civil servants in Kwara and Benue State on how remuneration influences their service delivery. Hence, the table shows that 12.1% and 25.2% minority of the civil servants strongly agreed and agreed respectively that what they earn as salary is good and so they feel satisfied to work efficiently while 27.5%, 22% and 13.1% majority of the civil servants did not agree. In addition, while 11.5% and 22% of the civil servant strongly agreed and agreed respectively that their salary is commensurate with their work performance and thus given them satisfaction on the job, 34.1%, 23.3% and 12.1% majority of them disagree, strongly disagreed and undecided. Similarly, 10.8% and 25.6% of the civil servants strongly agreed and agreed respectively that their workplace provides incentives that make them perform better on the job than their colleagues elsewhere while 31.1%, 16.7% and 15.7% majority of them responded on the contrary.

Moreover, the response to the statement, my enhanced pay has prevented me from leaving the establishment and also ensures improvement in my work performance, also revealed that 9.8% and 23.9% of the civil servant that strongly agreed and agreed are in minority, while 32.1%, 14.8% and 20% of them that disagreed, strongly disagreed and undecided are in the majority. In like manner, 11.1% and 22.6% minority of the civil servants strongly agreed and agreed that their salary and allowances have made them comfortable, safe and healthy and thus motivate them to work well, but 30.5%, 19.3% and 16.4% majority of them did not agree. Summarily, Table 1.1 has revealed that the level of remuneration in the Civil Service in Benue and Kwara States is not enough to motivate the employees effective service delivery (mean = 2.71)

**Hypotheses**

H<sub>1</sub>: Remuneration has significant effect on service delivery in Benue and Kwara states.

H<sub>0</sub>: Remuneration has no significant effect on service delivery in Benue and Kwara states.

A linear regression test was carried out to examine the extent of effect that remuneration has on service delivery. The dependent variable is service delivery while the independent variable is remuneration. The valid measure for this test was at significant level of p<0.05 such that when p-value was more than the significant level, the model is considered insignificant. The result of this test is displayed in Table 1.2.

**Table 1.2** Regression Analysis Result on the Effect of Remuneration on Service Delivery in Benue and Kwara States

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate		
1	0.386 <sup>a</sup>	0.149	0.146	3.773		
Predictors: (Constant), Remuneration						
<b>ANOVA</b>						
Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	755.484	1	755.484	53.077	0.000 <sup>b</sup>
	Residual	4312.844	303	14.234		
	Total	5068.328	304			
a. Dependent Variable: Service delivery						
b. Predictors: (Constant), Remuneration						
<b>Coefficient</b>						
Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.	
	B	Std. Error	Beta			
(Constant)	11.489	0.574		20.029	0.000	
Remuneration	0.279	0.038	0.386	7.285	0.000	
Dependent Variable: Service delivery						

Table 1.2 revealed the result of the linear regression on the effect of remuneration on service delivery in Benue and Kwara States. The table showed that there is a strong positive relationship between remuneration and service delivery ( $R = 0.386$ ). The table further revealed that remuneration had a statistical significant effect on service delivery  $F(1, 304) = 53.077$  ( $p < 0.05$ ). The regression coefficient of  $R^2 = 0.149$  at  $p\text{-value} = 0.000$ . This result revealed that remuneration was statistically significant and explained 14.9% of variance in service delivery. The results revealed further from the unstandardised coefficients of remuneration that a unit increase in remuneration will have a 0.386 unit increase in service delivery in Benue and Kwara States.

Based on this result in Table 1.2, the  $p$ -value of the model was found to be less than 0.05. Thus, the study rejected the null hypothesis and concluded that remuneration had significant effect on service delivery in Benue and Kwara States.

### 7. Discussion of Findings

From the table 1.2 of the study that is in line with the main objective of the study, it would be seen that remuneration had significant effect on service delivery in Benue and Kwara states. This implies that pay and rewards made available to civil servants influence their performance on the job in Benue and Kwara states. In other words, remuneration is low, the workers would not be motivated to work.

These findings were in line with the observation of Ikotun (2004), who posited that, when salaries and wages are grossly inadequate no ethical code or staff regulation can shield the organisation from numerous clever ways of misusing public funds. The need for good remuneration in the civil service can also be seen in a study carried out by Akinwale and George (2020), when the study revealed that all the variables under study like autonomy and responsibility, socio-political climate, recognition and achievements collectively determined nurses' job performance, but salary (remuneration) was the most fundamental influence of nurses' job satisfaction followed by their achievement and promotion.

### 8. Conclusion

Based on the findings of the study, it can be concluded that remuneration plays a significant role in the motivation of employees towards enhanced performance on the job in both Benue and Kwara states.

### 9. Recommendations

There should be improvement in the remuneration of workers in Benue and Kwara states. The state governments should implement the minimum wage Act to the letter, with consequential increment. Allowances such as leave bonus, duty-tour-allowance, and over-time allowance should be paid to the workers as and when due in the states by their respective state governments.

Secondly, Benue and Kwara states governments should increase their revenue drives so as to be able to augment what they receive from the federation account with internally generated revenue. The boards of internal revenue service of the two states should be strengthened in order to adequately position for these responsibilities of revenue drives.

### References

- Abah, E.O., & Nwoko, P.M. (2016). Work place motivation and employee productivity in the Nigerian public organisations: The Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria (FRCN) experience. *Journal of Resources Development and Management*, 20, 30-41. [www.iiste.org](http://www.iiste.org).
- Amobi, D. (2015). Remuneration challenges and industrial conflicts in Anambra State civil service system: A mitigation strategy. *NG – Journal of Social Development*, 5(1), 32-52. <https://www.researchgate.net>3108...>
- Aruma, E.O. & Hanachor, M.E. (2017). Abraham Maslow's hierarchy of needs and assessment of needs in Community Development. *International Journal of Development and Economic Sustainability*, 5(7), 15-27. <https://www.eajournals.org>...>
- Babatola, A.M., Oluwasanmi, L.A., & Rotkangi, D. D. (2020). An overview of the bane of remuneration and service delivery to government workers in Nigeria. A case Study of Ekiti civil servants. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science (IJRISS)*, IV(III), 215-217.
- Benson, S.K., & Lasisi, I. O. (2019). Managing reward in the civil service: Implications for employee's performance in Lagos State, Nigeria. *Ilorin Journal of Administration and Development*, 5(1), 1-12.
- Charles, J. (2020, December 10). Benue to pay junior workers minimum wage for now. *Punch Newspapers*. <https://punch.com>
- Chen, J. (2022). Industrial revolution. *Investopedia*. <https://www.investopedia.com>terms>

- Cole, G.A. (2002). *Personnel and Human Resource Management* (5<sup>th</sup> edition). London: Cengage Learning.
- Darma, N.A., & Ali, M. (2014). An Assessment of Public Sector Service Delivery in Nigeria: A Case Study of Federal Capital Territory Area Councils, 2007-2011. *International Journal of Development and Sustainability*, 3(8), 1756-1776.
- DBSA (2022). Impact of municipal infrastructure in basic service delivery in South Africa.
- Edeh, S.C. (2020). Nigeria civil service: Structure, characteristics, functions and problem. <https://bscholarly.com>nigerian>civ...>
- Ezigbo, O., Olaitan, K., Kolawole, Y., & Shittu (2019, November 18). Nigeria: Government releases circular on minimum wage consequential adjustment. *This Day* (Lagos). [allafrica.com>stories](http://allafrica.com>stories)
- Fagbemi, Soji-Eze (2018). History of Minimum Wage in Nigeria. [tribuneonline.com](http://tribuneonline.com)
- Ibuzor, O. (2017). *An overview of service delivery initiative: 12 years after*. Paper presented at National Policy Dialogue on Strategies for Improving Service Delivery in Government Parastatals, Agencies and Commissions in Nigeria at State House, Abuja. Retrieved on October 10, 2020 from <https://www.ganji.com>new10473>.
- Igbokwe-Ibeto, C.J., Agodika, F., & Osawe, C.O. (2015). Work content in the Nigerian civil service and its implication on sustainable development. *Singaporean Journal of Business Economics and Management Studies*, 4(4), 1-16.
- Ikotun, A. (2004). *Ethics in the Nigerian Public Service: An Analytical Perspective*. Lagos: Nugalithe Productions.
- James, M. (2021). Remuneration definition – Investopedia <https://www.investopedia.com>terms>
- Martin, M., & Whiting, F. (2016). *Human Resources Practice* (1<sup>st</sup> edition). London: Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development.
- Moris, G. T. (2017). Examine hindrance of Bureaucracy on Management Innovation for Organisations. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(4), 601-607.
- Mudulla, F.L. (2012). The effect of employee remuneration on organisational performance in the hotel and hospitality industries in Kenya. <https://so-plus.strathmore.edshandle>
- Mura, L., Gontkovicova, B., Spisakova, E.D. (2019). Position of employee benefits in remuneration structure. *Transformation in Business and Economics*, 18(2), 156-173.
- Nwakeaku, C., & Obiorah, B. (2019). Public service reforms and effective service delivery in Nigeria. *International Journal of Developing and Emerging Economics*, 7(4), 30-40. <https://www.eajournals.org>
- Nwogwugwu, N. (2015). Selected theories and praxis in Public Administration. In: J. N. Nwachukwu, A.O. Ogundiwin, & A.N. Nwaobia (eds.). *Anthology of Theories and their Applications in Social and Management Sciences*. 195-221. Lagos: Jamiro Press Link.
- Odunlade, R. (2012). Managing employee compensation and benefits for job satisfaction in Libraries and Information Centres in Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice* (e-journal), <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu>lib...>
- Okeke, P.A., Nwele, J.O., & Achilike, N.I. (2017). Impact of effective wage and salary administration on civil service productivity in Nigeria: A study of Anambra State. *Asian Journal of Applied Science and Technology (AJAST)*, 1(9), 421-438.
- Olaopa, T. (2021). Oransaye Report: Implementation and Cost of Governance challenge. *The Guardian*. [Guardian.ng](http://Guardian.ng)
- Oluata, O. (2019). *Nigeria: Tax, regulatory and other considerations for employee compensation*. Aderson Tax L.P. [www.mondaq.com](http://www.mondaq.com)
- Poisson, S. (2020). *What are the key assumptions of bureaucracy according to Weber?* <https://findanyanswer.com>what-are...>
- Prachi, J. (2021). *Bureaucratic theory of Public Administration*. [www.managementstudyguide.com](http://www.managementstudyguide.com)
- Prachi, M. (2019). *Max Weber Bureaucracy Theory*. <https://theinvestorsbook.com>.
- Serpa, S., & Ferreira, C.M. (2019). The Concept of Bureaucracy by Max-Weber. *International Journal of Social Science Studies*, 7(2), 12 DOI:10.11114/ijsssv712.3979
- Sharma, M.P., Sadana, B.L., & Kaur, H. (2013). 49<sup>th</sup> Reprint *Public Administration*. Kitab Mahal: Allahabad.
- Smalskys, V., & Urbanovic, J. (2017). *Civil Service Systems*. Oxford Research Encyclopedia. DOI:10.1093/awwefore/9780190228637
- Sule, O.E., Amoni, S.I., Obasan, K.A., & Banjo, N.A. (2015). Wages and Salaries as a motivational tool for enhancing organisational performance: A Survey of Selected Nigerian Workplace. *Euro Economic*, 1(34).
- UK Essays (2017). *Strengths and Weaknesses of Bureaucracy*. <https://www.ukessays.com>essays>
- Wantu, J. (2020, January 17). Benue approves implementation of ₦30,000 minimum wage for workers. *The Guardian*, <https://m.guardian.ng>